SECOND EDITION

Evidence-based HEALTHCARE

How to make Health Policy and Management Decisions

J. A. Muir Gray CBE

วช.
WY106
Evidence - based Healthcare
B0032683
ห้องสมุด วพบ นครราชสีมา

CHURCHILL LIVINGSTONE

CONTENTS

HOW TO USE THIS BOOK xxi

Finding and appraising evidence

Developing the capacity for evidence-based decision-making

Getting research into practice

DEFINING OUR TERMS xxv

Defining words with words

Defining words by numbers

Indefinite definitions

CONFESSIONS OF AN AMANUENSIS xxvii

Reference

ELECTRONIC UPDATES xxix

References

PROLOGUE
THE GLOBALISATION OF HEALTHCARE PROBLEMS AND THEIR SOLUTIONS 1

Common problems: common solutions 2

Problems and solutions in poorer countries 4

The USA and the rest of the developed world 5

References

Defining our terms: paying for, purchasing, and commissioning healthcare 7

CHAPTER 1
EVIDENCE-BASED HEALTHCARE 9

1.1 Evidence-based healthcare – a scientific approach to healthcare management 9

1.2 Why focus on decision-making? 10

Reference

1.3 The drivers of decision-making: evidence, values and resources 11

1.4 Evidence-based decision-making 11

1.4.1 Skills for healthcare decision-makers

1.4.2 Prerequisites for good decision-making

1.4.3 Reviewing decisions in the light of new evidence

1.5 Defining the scope of evidence-based healthcare 14

1.5.1 Stage 1: Producing evidence

1.5.2 Stage 2: Making evidence available

1.5.3 Stage 3: Using evidence

1.5.3.1 Evidence-based patient choice

1.5.3.2 Evidence-based clinical practice

1.5.3.3 Evidence-based policy-making, purchasing and management for health services

1.6 Realising the potential of evidence-based healthcare 19

1.7 Strategic approaches to implementing evidence-based decision-making in healthcare systems 20

1.7.1 Managed care
1.7.2 Integrated care pathways
1.7.3 Clinical guidelines
1.7.3.1 Who's accountable for guidelines?
1.7.3.2 Clinical guidelines and the law
1.7.3.3 Negligent authoring
1.7.3.4 Coping with the new Tower of Babel

1.8 Evidence-based healthcare and professional liberty 30

References

1.9 The limits of healthcare in improving health 31

1.9.1 Improving the health of populations
1.9.2 Improving the health of individual patients
1.9.2.1 Disease without illness
1.9.2.2 Illness without disease

References

1.10 The linguistics of an evidence-based approach 35

CHAPTER 2
'DOING THE RIGHT THINGS RIGHT' 37

2.1 The growing need for evidence-based healthcare 37

2.1.1 Population ageing
2.1.2 New technology and new knowledge
2.1.3 Patient expectations
2.1.4 Professional expectations
2.1.5 The limits to demand for healthcare

Reference

2.2 The evolution of evidence-based healthcare 41

2.2.1 Doing things cheaper
2.2.2 Doing things better
2.2.3 Doing things right
2.2.4 Doing the right things
2.2.5 Doing the right things right

2.3 Decision rules for resource allocation 45

Reference

2.4 The new management agenda 48

2.4.1 Strategies to increase the good:harm ratio
2.4.1.1 Starting starting right
2.4.1.2 Stopping starting and starting stopping
2.4.1.3 Slowing starting
2.4.2 Promoting relevant research
2.4.3 Managing the evolution of clinical practice

References

2.5 The impact of science on clinical practice and healthcare costs 57

Reference

2.6 Evidence-based altruism 59

2.6.1 Evidence of non-profit efficiency
2.6.2 Quality of care under capitation schemes

References

2.7 Who carries the can? 62

Defining our terms: value for money (bangs per buck)

CHAPTER 3
MAKING DECISIONS ABOUT HEALTH SERVICES 65

3.1 The context of the decision under consideration 66
3.1.1 Dealing with difficult decisions
3.1.2 Battalions of difficult decisions

3.2 Therapy 67
3.2.1 Dimensions and definitions
3.2.2 Searching
3.2.3 Appraisal
3.2.3.1 Therapy: the balance of good and harm
3.2.3.2 Assessing innovations in health service delivery
3.2.4 Getting research into practice
3.2.4.1 Therapy
3.2.4.2 Innovations in health service delivery

Reference

3.3 Tests 72
3.3.1 Dimensions and definitions
3.3.1.1 Sensitivity and specificity
3.3.1.2 Sensitivity and predictive value
3.3.1.3 Between a rock and a hard place
3.3.1.4 Tests: the producer's perspective
3.3.1.5 Tests: the purchaser's perspective
3.3.2 Searching
3.3.3 Appraisal
3.3.4 Getting research into practice

References

3.4 Screening 84
3.4.1 Dimensions and definitions
3.4.1.1 The changing balance of good and harm
3.4.2 Searching
3.4.3 Appraisal
3.4.4 Getting research into practice
3.4.5 Aphoristic warnings

References

3.5 Health policy 95
3.5.1 Dimensions and definitions
3.5.1.1 Healthcare policy
3.5.1.2 Health or public health policy
3.5.2 Searching
3.5.3 Appraisal
3.5.3.1 Appropriate study designs
3.5.3.2 Natural experiments
3.5.3.3 Appraising research on health policies
3.5.4 Getting research into practice

References

CHAPTER 4
SEARCHING FOR EVIDENCE 101

4.1 The searcher's problems 101
4.1.1 The relevance gap – absence of high-quality evidence
4.1.2 The publication gap – failure to publish research results
4.1.3 The hunting gap – difficulties in finding published research
4.1.3.1 The limitations of electronic databases
4.1.3.2 Inadequate indexing
4.1.4 The quality gap – the need for critical appraisal
4.1.4.1 Misleading abstracts
4.1.4.2 Bias in published papers

References

4.2 The information broker 109

Further reading

4.3 Coping alone 111
4.3.1 Becoming a better scanner
4.3.2 Becoming a better searcher
4.3.3 Becoming better at critical appraisal

4.3.4 Becoming a better storekeeper
4.3.5 Use it or lose it

4.4 Developing libraries for the 21st century 113
4.4.1 Defining features of the e-library
4.4.2 The National electronic Library for Health

Further reading

CHAPTER 5
APPRAISING THE QUALITY OF RESEARCH 117

5.1 What is research? 117
5.1.1 Hypothesis-testing research
5.1.2 Fraud in medical research

References

5.2 Choosing the right research method 121

5.3 Systematic reviews 122
5.3.1 Dimensions and definitions
5.3.1.1 Meta-analysis
5.3.2 Searching
5.3.3 Appraisal
5.3.3.1 Systematic reviews
5.3.3.2 Systematic reviews including meta-analysis
5.3.4 Uses and abuses

References

5.4 Randomised controlled trials 133
5.4.1 Dimensions and definitions
5.4.1.1 Mega trials
5.4.1.2 Patient preference in trials
5.4.1.3 'N of 1' trials
5.4.2 Searching
5.4.3 Appraisal
5.4.3.1 Subgroup analysis
5.4.4 Uses and abuses
5.4.4.1 Interpretation and presentation
5.4.4.2 Aphoristic warnings

Further reading

References

5.5 Case-control studies 143
5.5.1 Dimensions and definitions
5.5.1.1 Study of the causation of disease
5.5.1.2 Study of the adverse effects of treatment
5.5.2 Searching
5.5.3 Appraisal
5.5.4 Uses and abuses

References

5.6 Cohort studies 146
5.6.1 Dimensions and definitions
5.6.1.1 The role of clinical databases
5.6.2 Searching
5.6.3 Appraisal
5.6.4 Uses and abuses

References

5.7 Surveys 151
5.7.1 Dimensions and definitions
5.7.2 Searching
5.7.3 Appraisal
5.7.4 Uses and abuses

References

5.8 Decision analysis 154
5.8.1 Dimensions and definitions
5.8.2 Searching
5.8.3 Appraisal
5.8.4 Uses and abuses

References

5.9 Qualitative research 160
5.9.1 Dimensions and definitions
5.9.2 Searching
5.9.3 Appraisal
5.9.4 Uses and abuses

Reference

5.10 Hallmarks for knowledge 164
5.10.1 The need for hallmarking
5.10.2 The pitfalls of hallmarking

ห้องสมุด
วิทยาลัยพยาบาลฯ นครราชสีมา

5.10.3 Examples of knowledge hallmarks in the healthcare sector
5.10.4 The unreliability of some knowledge hallmarks
5.10.4.1 The use of declarative titles – a Christmas cracker from the *New England Journal of Medicine*
5.10.4.2 Peer-review – the death of another sacred cow
5.10.5 Caveat lector

References

CHAPTER 6
ASSESSING THE OUTCOMES FOUND 169

6.1 Five key questions about outcomes 169
6.1.1 How many outcomes were studied?
6.1.2 How large were the effects found?
6.1.2.1 Which yardstick?
6.1.3 With what degree of confidence can the results of the research be applied to the whole population?
6.1.4 Does the intervention do more good than harm?
6.1.4.1 L'Abbé plots
6.1.5 How relevant are the results to the local population or service?
6.1.6 The clinician's dilemma

References

6.2 Measuring outcomes 181
6.2.1 Problems and pitfalls of performance measurement
6.2.1.1 Natural problems
6.2.1.2 Man-made problems
6.2.2 In praise of process

Reference

6.3 Equity 183
6.3.1 Dimensions and definitions
6.3.1.1 Measuring equity
6.3.1.2 Assessing equity: evidence-based cuts at the margin
6.3.2 Searching
6.3.3 Appraisal
6.3.4 Applicability and relevance

6.4 Effectiveness 185
6.4.1 Dimensions and definitions
6.4.1.1 Assessing effectiveness from the patient's perspective
6.4.1.2 Improving outcomes by providing emotional support
6.4.1.3 Improving outcomes through patient participation
6.4.1.4 Improving outcomes through process: in the absence of an effective technical intervention
6.4.2 Searching
6.4.3 Appraisal
6.4.3.1 Experimental studies of effectiveness
6.4.3.2 Observational studies of effectiveness
6.4.4 Applicability and relevance

References

6.5 Safety 194
6.5.1 Dimensions and definitions
6.5.2 Searching
6.5.3 Appraisal
6.5.3.1 Which method?
6.5.3.2 Appraising the quality of studies on safety
6.5.4 Applicability and relevance

References

6.6 Patient satisfaction and patients' experience of care 200
6.6.1 Dimensions and definitions
6.6.1.1 Acceptability of care
6.6.1.2 Patient satisfaction
6.6.1.3 Patients' experience of care

6.6.1.4 Is the measurement of patient satisfaction of any use?
6.6.1.5 Does patient satisfaction bring physician satisfaction?
6.6.2 Searching
6.6.3 Appraisal
6.6.4 Applicability and relevance

References

6.7 Cost-effectiveness 209
6.7.1 Dimensions and definitions
6.7.1.1 Productivity and efficiency
6.7.1.2 Cochrane's definition of efficiency
6.7.1.3 The advent of the concept of cost-effectiveness
6.7.1.4 Assessing cost-effectiveness: the use of outcome measures
6.7.1.5 Marginal and opportunity costs
6.7.1.6 Economic evaluations
6.7.2 Searching
6.7.3 Appraisal
6.7.4 Applicability and relevance

References

6.8 Quality 219
6.8.1 Dimensions and definitions
6.8.1.1 Quality assessment by measuring the process of care
6.8.1.2 Quality assessment by measuring the outcome of care
6.8.1.3 Reporting outcomes in the public domain
6.8.2 Searching for and appraising evidence on standards of care
6.8.2.1 Searching for papers on quality standards
6.8.2.2 Appraising evidence on quality standards
6.8.3 Searching for and appraising evidence on variations in healthcare outcome
6.8.3.1 Searching for papers on variations in healthcare outcome
6.8.3.2 Appraising evidence on variations in healthcare outcome
6.8.4 Applicability and relevance

References

6.9 Appropriateness 229
6.9.1 Dimensions and definitions
6.9.1.1 Appropriateness for individual patients
6.9.1.2 Appropriateness for groups of patients or populations
6.9.1.3 Identifying concerns about appropriateness
6.9.1.4 It may be appropriate but is it necessary?
6.9.1.5 Who defines necessity?
6.9.1.6 Medical futility
6.9.2 Searching
6.9.3 Appraisal
6.9.4 Applicability and relevance

References

CHAPTER 7
THE EVIDENCE-BASED ORGANISATION 243

7.1 Creating the context for an evidence-based organisation 243
7.1.1 Types of knowledge
7.1.1.1 Knowledge from experience
7.1.2 The learning organisation
7.1.3 Hypertext organisations
7.1.4 The knowledge-rich organisation
7.1.5 The evidence-based knowledge-rich learning organisation
7.1.5.1 Kondratieff cycles on

References

7.2 An evidence-based health service 249

7.3 Culture 251
7.3.1 The evidence-based chief executive
7.3.2 Evidence-based management

7.4 Systems 253
7.4.1 Systems that provide evidence
7.4.1.1 The 'evidence centre'
7.4.1.2 The National electronic Library for Health
7.4.2 Systems that promote the use of evidence
7.4.2.1 Evidence-based clinical audit
7.4.2.2 Training for evidence-based decision-making
7.4.3 Systems that consume and use evidence
7.4.3.1 Systems that should be more evidence based
7.4.3.2 Systems for managing innovation

7.5 Structure 262
7.5.1 Creating a team for managing knowledge
7.5.2 Getting research into purchasing and practice

References

7.6 Evidence-based primary care 264
7.6.1 Improving access: promoting finding
7.6.1.1 Ease of access to information
7.6.1.2 Provision of relevant information
7.6.2 Improving appraisal skills

Reference

7.7 Evidence-based purchasing and commissioning 269
7.7.1 Resource reallocation among disease management systems
7.7.2 Resource reallocation within a single disease management system
7.7.3 Managing innovation
7.7.3.1 Promoting innovation – starting starting right
7.7.3.2 Stopping starting, starting stopping and slowing starting
7.7.3.3 Promoting trials
7.7.4 Evidence-based insurance
7.7.5 "Black belt" decision-making
7.7.6 The limits of structural reform

References

7.8 Promoting evidence-based management 283
7.8.1 Analysis of obstacles
7.8.2 Promoting implementation

References

7.9 Evidence-based policy-making 286
7.9.1 The dominance of values in policy-making
7.9.2 The influence of budgetary pressures
7.9.3 The growing influence of evidence in policy-making
7.9.4 Healthcare policy-making
7.9.4.1 The NHS Plan
7.9.5 Public health policy-making
7.9.5.1 Does the evidence show an increased risk?
7.9.5.2 Is it possible to reduce the risk?
7.9.5.3 The use of legislation to promote public health
7.9.6 Evidence-based policy-making in the developing world

References

7.10 Evidence-based litigation 300
7.10.1 'Evidence' in court
7.10.2 Death of an expert witness
7.10.3 The influence of clinical guidelines in malpractice litigation
7.10.4 Failure to act on the evidence

References

7.11 The ethics of prioritisation – the individual or society? 305

CHAPTER 8
EVIDENCE-BASED PUBLIC HEALTH 307

8.1 The evolution of public health epistemology 307
8.1.1 Scripturally based public health
8.1.2 Supernaturally based public health
8.1.3 Aesthetically based public health
8.1.3.1 Fear as an agent of social change
8.1.3.2 Knowledge as an agent of social change
8.1.3.3 The Siege of Krishnapur – miasmatists vs Snowites
8.1.4 Statistically based public health
8.1.5 Epidemiologically based public health
8.1.5.1 Epidemiology as the foundation for public health practice
8.1.6 Evidence-based public health
8.1.6.1 The promotion of evidence-based healthcare
8.1.6.2 Future challenges

References

8.2 Evidence-based public health interventions 320
8.2.1 Healthcare interventions
8.2.2 Educational interventions
8.2.3 Social and community action
8.2.4 The use of legislative power to improve the public health
8.2.4.1 Value-based policy-making
8.2.4.2 Evidence-based policy-making
8.2.5 Evidence-based humanitarianism

References

CHAPTER 9
DEVELOPING THE EVIDENCE MANAGEMENT SKILLS OF INDIVIDUALS 327

9.1 The pre-requisite: being able to ask the right question 328

9.2 Searching 329
9.2.1 Competencies
9.2.2 Training
9.2.3 Scanning

9.3 Appraising evidence 330
9.3.1 Competencies
9.3.2 Training

9.4 Storing and retrieving 331
9.4.1 Competencies
9.4.2 Training
9.4.3 Aphorisms on storage and retrieval

9.5 Learning by doing 333
9.5.1 Informatics support for staff who are learning by doing
9.5.2 Support for staff who are learning by doing: the educational prescription

References

9.6 The 'compleat' healthcare manager 337

CHAPTER 10
THE EVIDENCE-BASED CONSULTATION 339

Reference

10.1 Types of clinical decision 339
10.1.1 'Faceless' decision-making
10.1.2 Face-to-face decision-making

10.2 Patient communication 341
10.2.1 The provision of evidence-based information

10.2.1.1 Other sources of information for patients
10.2.2 Interpretation
10.2.3 Discussion

10.3 Evidence-based patient choice 347
10.3.1 Factors inhibiting evidence-based patient choice
10.3.1.1 Clinical ignorance
10.3.1.2 Emphasising the benefits of intervention
10.3.1.3 Disclosure

References

10.4 Evidence-based clinical practice 351
10.4.1 Definitions and dimensions
10.4.2 Failures in clinical decision-making
10.4.3 Clinical freedom
10.4.4 Clinical governance
10.4.5 To whom should the clinician be loyal – patient or State?
10.4.6 Remember the multiple goals of therapy
10.4.7 Shared decision-making

References

10.5 Clinicians: witch doctors or scientists? – dealing with anxiety 364

Reference

10.6 Accelerating change in clinical practice 366
10.6.1 Educate to influence
10.6.2 Carrots or sticks?
10.6.3 Growing carrots

References

EPILOGUE
EVIDENCE-BASED HEALTHCARE IN THE POST-MODERN ERA 371

Evidence, economics and ethics 371

Doing better, feeling worse 373

The modernisation of medicine 374

Post-modern medicine 375
Die Risikogesellschaft
Evidence-based risk management

Post-modern clinical practice 377
Anxiety and disease
Dealing with anxiety: medicine or magic?
The 21st century clinician

APPENDICES 381

Introduction to appendices 381

APPENDIX I
FINDING THE EVIDENCE 383

I.1 Resource overview 383

I.2 Resources 384
I.2.1 The Cochrane Library
I.2.1.1 The Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews
I.2.1.2 Database of Abstracts of Reviews of Effectiveness
I.2.1.3 The Cochrane Controlled Trials Register
I.2.1.4 The Cochrane Review Methodology Database
I.2.2 Best Evidence
I.2.3 EBM Reviews, Best Evidence
I.2.4 NHS Centre for Reviews and Dissemination (CRD) publications
I.2.4.1 CRD Reports

I.2.4.2 Effective Health Care Bulletins
I.2.4.3 Effectiveness Matters
I.2.5 Other good-quality reviews
I.2.5.1 Health Technology Assessment reports
I.2.5.2 Clinical Standards Advisory Group reports
I.2.5.3 The epidemiologically based needs assessment reviews
I.2.5.4 Health Evidence Bulletins, Wales
I.2.6 MEDLINE
I.2.7 EMBASE
I.2.8 Subject specialist databases
I.2.8.1 Health Management Information Consortium
I.2.8.2 HealthSTAR
I.2.8.3 HEALTH-CD
I.2.8.4 Other databases
I.2.9 Registers of published research
I.2.10 Unpublished Evidence: Registers of Research in Progress
I.2.10.1 National Research Register
I.2.10.2 Health Services Research Projects in Progress (HSRPROJ)

I.3 Organisations 398
I.3.1 The Cochrane Collaboration
I.3.2 NHS Centre for Reviews and Dissemination
I.3.3 InterTASC
I.3.4 Aggressive Research Intelligence Facility

I.4 The Internet 400
I.4.1 Turning Research Into Practice (TRIP) database
I.4.2 NHS Economic Evaluation Database
I.4.3 Health Technology Assessment Database
I.4.4 Health Technology Assessment Agencies
I.4.5 Medical Search Engines
I.4.5.1 OMNI
I.4.5.2 CliniWeb
I.4.5.3 Medfinder
I.4.5.4 Healthfinder

References

Further Reading

APPENDIX II
FILTERING THE EVIDENCE 405

II.1 Resource overview 405

II.2 Resources 406
II.2.1 PubMed Clinical Queries Interface
II.2.2 SUMSearch
II.2.3 Institute of Health Sciences (IHS) Library Filters

II.3 The Internet 407

Reference

Further reading
How to harness MEDLINE
Other items

APPENDIX III
APPRAISING THE EVIDENCE 409

III.1 Resource overview 409

III.2 Resources 409
III.2.1 ACP Journal Club
III.2.2 Bandolier
III.2.3 Clinical Evidence
III.2.4 Evidence-Based Health Care Workbook and CD-ROM
III.2.5 Evidence-based Healthcare
III.2.6 Evidence-Based Medicine
III.2.7 Evidence-Based Mental Health
III.2.8 Evidence-Based Nursing
III.2.9 CAT-Maker

III.3 Organisations 412
III.3.1 NHS R&D Centre for Evidence-Based Medicine
III.3.2 Centre for Evidence-Based Child Health
III.3.3. Centre for Evidence Based Mental Health
III.3.4 Centre for Evidence-Based Nursing
III.3.5 Critical Appraisal Skills Programme
III.3.6 North Thames Research Appraisal Group

III.4 The Internet 415
III.4.1 EBM Tool Kit
III.4.2 Journal Club on the Web
III.4.3 Journal of Family Practice Patient Orientated Evidence that Matters (POEMS)

References

Further Reading

Users' Guides to the Medical Literature (JAMA)
Other items

APPENDIX IV STORING THE EVIDENCE 419

IV.1 Resource overview 419

IV.2 Resources 420
IV.2.1 EndNote
IV.2.2 PAPYRUS
IV.2.3 ProCite
IV.2.4 Reference Manager

Further reading

APPENDIX V IMPLEMENTING THE EVIDENCE 423

V.1 Resource overview 423

V.2 Resource 423
V.2.1 Effective Practice and Organisation of Care (EPOC) Database

V.3 Organisations and initiatives 424
V.3.1 Contacts, Help, Advice and Information Network (CHAIN)
V.3.2 The Cochrane Effective Practice and Organisation of Care (EPOC) group
V.3.3 Framework for Appropriate Care Throughout Sheffield (FACTS) Project
V.3.4 Promoting Action on Clinical Effectiveness (PACE)
V.3.5 Primary Care Information Management across Anglia (PRIMA)
V.3.6 Primary Care Sharing the Evidence (PRISE)

V.4 The Internet 426
V.4.1 Implementation and Change in the Health Service

References

Further reading

INDEX 429